

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

## CITY OF DAVENPORT, IOWA

TUESDAY, JANUARY 10, 2023; 5:00 PM

CITY HALL | 226 WEST 4<sup>TH</sup> STREET | COUNCIL CHAMBERS

### I. Call to Order

Chairperson McGivern called the meeting to order.

Present: McGivern, Franken, Miranda, Higgins, Hustedde

Excused: Lesthaeghe, Powers

Staff Present: Berkley, Werderitch, Ralfs

### II. Secretary's Report

#### A. Consideration of the October 11, 2022 meeting minutes.

Motion by Miranda, second by Higgins, to approve the October 11, 2022 meeting minutes. Minutes were unanimously approved by voice vote (5-0).

### III. Communications

The Commission welcomed its newest Commissioner, Michael Hustedde.

### IV. Old Business

### V. New Business

#### A. Case COA23-01: Request for exterior alteration at 624 West 5th Street. The Charles and Amelia (Ruch) McElroy House is located within the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Duane Timm, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch presented an overview of the rear porch addition and the associated building materials. The property owner believes the original structure had a covered porch along the northeast elevation that was removed at an unknown date.

Duane Timm, petitioner, was in attendance to answer questions.

Staff recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration at 624 West 5th Street in accordance with the submitted material, subject to the following condition:

1. The porch shall be attached to the structure using the least invasive means possible to best preserve the brick exterior.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

2. New additions and related new construction shall not be discouraged when such improvements do not destroy historic material and such design is compatible with the size, massing, scale, color, materials and character of the property, neighborhood and district, if applicable.
3. A proposed alteration, construction, reconstruction or addition should not negatively impact the scale of the designated property.

Motion by Higgins, second by Franken, to approve staff recommendation and condition for Case COA23-01. Motion to approve staff recommendation passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- B. Case COA23-02: Installation of accessible playground equipment at Vander Veer Park at 223 West Central Park Avenue. Vander Veer Park is a locally listed historic landmark. City of Davenport, petitioner. [Ward 5]

Werderitch provided a summary of the project. The City of Davenport is planning to expand Gabe's Play Village, an ability-inclusive playground, at Vander Veer Park with the installation of a new ADA swing. The play equipment is located in the center of the park, between the parking lot and lagoon. The swing will be installed on the west corner of the playground. There will be no disturbance to the existing trees or landscaping.

Betsy Tubbs, Park & Recreation Department, was in attendance to answer questions.

Staff made a recommendation to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of accessible playground equipment at Vander Veer Park in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standard:

1. New additions and related new construction shall not be discouraged when such improvements do not destroy historic material and such design is compatible with the size, massing, scale, color, materials and character of the property, neighborhood and district, if applicable.

Motion by Franken, second by Miranda, to approve staff recommendation for Case COA23-02. Motion to approve staff recommendation passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- C. Case COA23-03: Request for exterior alteration at 521 West 6th Street. The Dr. Gustav Hoepfner House and Office is located within the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. ILLIOWA Holdings LLC, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch presented an overview of the project scope and history of alterations to the home. The proposed scope of work did not appear to diminish the character of the original structure, since the alterations are largely performed on the south basement

wall. It was difficult to determine whether the materials being replaced were from the building's initial construction in 1874. The existing basement door was not original.

Since there have been several additions to the home, there is a mismatch of wood, vinyl, and asbestos siding. The applicant is proposing to replace the deteriorated wood siding around the basement door with vinyl. The total wall spans approximately four feet in width, with the door covering a majority of the area. An engineered wood siding may be a more appropriate material given the scope of the project.

Similar to the siding, there is also a mismatch of soffit and fascia materials. Sections of the building have aluminum wrap, while the original structure appears to have wood. While the installation of aluminum soffit and fascia will bring uniformity to the structure, a wood or engineered wood product may be more appropriate with the character of the district.

Staff believed the proposed alterations will not negatively impact the historic character of the Hamburg District. The improvements will bring the property into a good state of repair.

Peter Theis, ILLOWA Holdings LLC, was in attendance to speak on behalf of the project. He explained the history of renovations to the building throughout the years. The intention is to reside the home at a later date in a uniform material.

Commissioners inquired about the building materials on the home, specifically the siding, soffit, and fascia. It was the desire of the Commission to have a uniform siding material on the building that would be sympathetic to the historic district, such as wood or composite siding. Should new siding be installed at a later date, the Commission voiced that vinyl would not be an appropriate material.

Staff made a recommendation to approve the structural elements identified in the Certificate of Appropriateness Application at 521 West 6th Street. However, Staff recommended the Commission provide direction on acceptable and consistent building materials.

The Commission should review the project for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The following are applicable criteria:

1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.
2. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

Motion by Hustedde, second by Higgins, to approve the project scope and materials as presented in Case COA23-03. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- D. Case COA23-04: Request to install new garage doors at 625 West 7th Street. The Hans Goos House is located within the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Brett Lutz, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Prior to the meeting, the applicant notified City staff requesting the item be tabled to the February 14, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting. The petitioner was unable to attend the January meeting.

Motion by Higgins, second by Miranda, to table Case COA23-04. Motion to table passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- E. Case NRHP23-01: Review and provide a recommendation for the International Harvester Truck Sales and Service Station at 601 West 2nd Street to be listed on the National Register of Historic Places. [Ward 3]

Staff explained that as a participant in the Certified Local Government Program, the Historic Preservation Commission is required to review and comment on proposed National Register nominations of properties within its jurisdiction.

The question for the Historic Preservation Commission to answer when reviewing the nomination is whether the nominated property meets the National Register of Historic Places criteria for significance and integrity.

Bill Nielsen, property owner, virtually participated in the discussion.

Staff recommended the International Harvester Truck Sales and Service Station at 601 West 2<sup>nd</sup> Street be listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The Commission shall authorize the Chairperson to sign the Certified Local Government National Register Nomination Evaluation Report Form.

The nomination achieves consistency with Criterion A (Historical Events) and Criterion C (Architecture).

1. The International Harvester Truck Sales and Service Station is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the board patterns of our history. (Criterion A)
2. The International Harvester Truck Sales and Service Station embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction. (Criterion C)

Motion by Franken, second by Miranda, to approve staff recommendation for Case NRHP23-01. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

## VI. Other Business

- A. Please Note: The February 14th and March 14th Historic Preservation Commission meetings will be held in the Davenport Police Department Community Room, 416 N. Harrison Street.

VII. Open Forum for Comment

VIII. Adjourn

Motion by Higgins, second by Franken, to adjourn the meeting. Motion passed by a voice vote (5-0). The meeting adjourned at 5:42 pm.

IX. Next Commission Meeting: February 14, 2023